

# API Ballot Summary Sheet

3/23/2005

**Ballot: 26-05: 653-193, Requirements for Floating Roof Repairs**

**AMS ID: 628**

**Start Date:** 1/24/05

**Closing Date:** 3/14/05

**Associate:** Roland Goodman

**Coordinator:** Valeen Young

**Proposal:**

## Vote Results

<u>Voter</u>	<u>Company</u>	<u>Comments</u>	<u>Vote Results</u>			
			<u>Affirmative</u>	<u>Negative</u>	<u>Abstain</u>	<u>Did Not Vote</u>
134629	Nelson Acosta	HMT Inspection	Yes	X		
138021	Moraya Al-Gahtani	Saudi Aramco	No	X		
79326	Gregory Alvarado	Equity Engineering Group, Inc., The	No	X		
131617	Joel Andreani	Equity Engineering Group, Inc., The	No	X		
38921	Robert Annett	Alyeska Pipeline	No			X
73074	Ronald Bailey	American Tank & Vessel, Inc.	No	X		
136219	Mark Baker	Baker Consulting Group, Inc.	No	X		
142888	Chris Bashor	Minnesota Pollution Control Agency	No	X		
134681	Ernie Blanchard	IMC-Phosphates	No	X		
109375	Jerry Boldra		No			X
22200	Dan Boley	DJA Inspection Services	No	X		
135851	David Bryan	Marathon Ashland Petroleum, LLC	No	X		
130397	Jerry Burke	GE Panametrics	No			X
134782	Steve Caruthers	Tank Consultants, Inc.	No	X		
7127	Earl Crochet	Kinder Morgan	No	X		
132217	Dwayne Davis	Stone & Webster, Inc	No			X
142685	Domingo de Para	ExxonMobil	No	X		
133403	Jeffrey DeArmond	BP p.l.c. Whiting Refinery	No	X		
133429	Robert Dolejs	UOP LLC	No	X		
128480	Wayne Elliott	Elliott Services, Inc.	No	X		
135965	Kenneth Erdmann	Matrix Service Company	No	X		
128483	Robert Ferrell	The National Board of Boiler & Pressure	No	X		
133207	John Fiore	FTS, Inc.	No	X		
105011	David Flight	Dow Chemical Company	No			X
134870	Laurence Foster	Marathon Ashland Petroleum LLC	Yes		X	
134880	John Fumbanks	Pond and Company Inc.	No			X
133538	Frank Furillo	ExxonMobil Corp.	No			X

# API Ballot Summary Sheet

3/23/2005

**Ballot: 26-05: 653-193, Requirements for Floating Roof Repairs**

**AMS ID: 628**

**Start Date:** 1/24/05

**Closing Date:** 3/14/05

**Associate:** Roland Goodman

**Coordinator:** Valeen Young

**Proposal:**

115033	Alan Geis	Colonial Pipeline Company	No	X		
84365	Mark Geisenhoff	Flint Hills Resources, LP	No	X		
83689	Ty Hagen	Hagen Engineering International, Inc.	No	X		
133668	Gary Heath	All Tech Inspection	No	X		
136619	Robert Hendrix	Voridian Engineering & Construction	No	X		
70596	Marty Herlevic	James Machine Works, Inc.	No	X		
91812	Peter Hunt	Shell Chemical Company	No	X		
89501	N. Jones	Pro-Inspect Inc.	No			X
93133	Randy Kissell	TGB Partnership	Yes		X	
26542	Morris Kline	HMT Inspection	No	X		
135705	Owen Konski	Syncrude Canada Ltd.	No			X
75330	Dennis Layman	BP p.l.c.	No	X		
81918	Manfred Lengsfeld		No			X
135014	John Lieb	Tank Industry Consultants, Inc.	Yes		X	
136274	Thomas Lorentz	AEC Engineering, Inc.	No			X
128476	John Ludman	DuPont Engineering Technology	No	X		
135072	Francis Maitland	Quense LLC	No			X
78399	David Martin	Conservatek Industries, Inc.	No	X		
113545	James McBride	Petrex, Inc.	No	X		
138401	John McMillan	Mechanical Integrity Inc.	No	X		
146748	Tim McMullen	Terasen Pipelines (USA) Inc.	No	X		
139443	James McVay	Tesoro Petroleum	No	X		
139045	Craig Meier	ConocoPhillips	No			X
137255	Carl Mikkola	Enbridge Energy Partners. L.P.	No	X		
131185	Douglas Miller	Chicago Bridge & Iron Company(CB&I)	Yes		X	
114038	Ron Miller	Physical Acoustics Corporation	No			X
69609	Bhana Mistry	TIW Steel Platework	No	X		
83736	John Mooney		No	X		
92212	George Morovich	TEMCOR	No	X		
136286	Philip Myers	ChevronTexaco Corporation	Yes	X		
132210	David Nasab	Kellogg Brown & Root	No	X		

# API Ballot Summary Sheet

3/23/2005

**Ballot: 26-05: 653-193, Requirements for Floating Roof Repairs**

**AMS ID: 628**

**Start Date:** 1/24/05

**Closing Date:** 3/14/05

**Associate:** Roland Goodman

**Coordinator:** Valeen Young

**Proposal:**

140695	Richard Nichols	Roddey Engineering Services, Inc.	No		X	
139601	John O'Brien	Innovative Research Consultants	No			X
82544	John Oleyar	HMT, Inc.	No			X
82270	Robert Pechacek	General Electric Inspection Services	No	X		
5193	Richard Pinegar	Cargill Inc.	No	X		
102412	Roy Ralph	Petro-Canada	No			X
10929	John Reynolds	Shell Global Solutions (US) Inc.	Yes	X		
135169	Michael Richardson	International Paper	No	X		
102879	James Riley	ChevronTexaco Energy Technology Cor	No	X		
73744	Bruce Roberts		No	X		
102884	Joe Don Sanders	Lyondell Citgo Refinery	No			X
77480	Clinton Schulz	Citgo Refining & Chemical Co.	No			X
138135	Michael Shallis	Longview Inspection, Inc.	No		X	
101360	Marilyn Shores	Sunoco Logistics	No	X		
145484	Ryan Sitton	Berwanger, Inc.	No			X
132992	Robert Smallwood	DNV USA	No	X		
78185	Kelly Smith	ConocoPhillips	No	X		
126019	Larry Speaks	Mass Technology Corporation	No	X		
73144	Kenneth Tam		No	X		
134314	Tearle Taylor	Flint Hills Resources	No	X		
134325	Donald Thain	Shell Global Solutions (US) Inc.	No			X
137459	Roland Valdes	Inspection Solutions, LLC	No			X
145034	Leith Watkins	Explorer Pipeline Company	No	X		
145896	Alan Watson	A.R. Watson, USA	No	X		
134558	John Watson	The Dow Chemical Company	No	X		
135619	Steven Wells	Capstone Engineering Services, Inc.	No	X		
132209	Richard Whipple	Fluor, Inc.	No			X

# API Ballot Summary Sheet

3/23/2005

**Ballot: 26-05: 653-193, Requirements for Floating Roof Repairs**

**AMS ID: 628**

**Start Date:** 1/24/05

**Closing Date:** 3/14/05

**Associate:** Roland Goodman

**Coordinator:** Valeen Young

**Proposal:**

	<u>Affirmative</u>	<u>Negative</u>	<u>Abstain</u>	<u>Did Not Vote</u>
<b>Balloting Totals:</b>	<b>56</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>23</b>

<b>Total Responses:</b>	<b>62</b>	
<b>Total Ballots:</b>	<b>85</b>	
<b>Response Rate :</b>	<b>66%</b>	Must be > 50%
<b>Approval Rate:</b>	<b>93%</b>	Must be > 67%
<b>Consensus:</b>	<b>YES</b>	

**API Template for Ballot Comments and Resolution**

Ballot ID: 628	Date: March 23, 2005	Document: <b>Ballot 26-05: 653-193</b>
----------------	----------------------	--

#	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	<b>Voter/ Commenter</b>	<b>Company</b>	<b>Section No. (e.g. 3.1)</b>	<b>Type of comment</b>	<b>Comment (justification for change)</b>	<b>Proposed Change</b>	<b>Comment Resolution</b>
1	Philip Myers	ChevronTexaco Corporation		Technical	I would like to read much stronger by wording the last sentence "A floatation test of the repaired roof should be performed as a method to verify the integrity of the floating roof surfaces in contact with product." I would emphasize that lots of NDE should be performed on these surfaces if the floatation test is not performed.		
2	John Lieb	Tank Industry Consultants, Inc.	12.1.10.1	Technical	The wording in this section is still confusing. By the use of the word "shall", it requires an air leak, vacuum box, penetrating oil, or other test to verify the (leak) integrity of the the roof. It also allows that a floatation test be performed to verify the integrity of the roof. The intent is not clear as to whether the floatation test may replace the aforementioned tests or whether they are required in all cases. It is also not clear as to the extent of the air leak, vacuum box or other testing that must be performed. Does this apply only to new and repaired welds or to all welds? This should be clarified.	Intent should be discussed and appropriate clarifications developd.	
3	Randy Kissell	TGB Partnership	12.1.10.1	Technical	The wording of this section is unclear as to whether a hydrostatic test may be performed in lieu of an air leak, vacuum box, penetrating oil, tracer gas test, or other applicable non destructive testing method approved by the authorized inspector.	<p>Change to:</p> <p>"After repair work is complete, the authorized inspector shall:</p> <p>a)perform a visual examination from the top and bottom side of the floating roof and</p> <p>b)perform an air leak, vacuum box, penetrating oil, tracer gas, or other applicable non destructive test. (Refer to Appendix F – NDE Requirements Summary).</p> <p>As an alternative to b), the authorized inspector may conduct a floatation test.</p>	

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 6 are compulsory.

API *electronic balloting commenting template/version 2002-12*

**API Template for Ballot Comments and Resolution**

Ballot ID: 628	Date: March 23, 2005	Document: <b>Ballot 26-05: 653-193</b>
----------------	----------------------	--

#	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	<b>Voter/ Commenter</b>	<b>Company</b>	<b>Section No. (e.g. 3.1)</b>	<b>Type of comment</b>	<b>Comment (justification for change)</b>	<b>Proposed Change</b>	<b>Comment Resolution</b>
4	Laurence Foster	Marathon Ashland Petroleum LLC	12.1.10.1	Other	Section 12.1.1 designates who is to perform the examination and by what method. Floating roof repairs should not be different. Requiring the authorized inspector to do the visual exam goes significantly beyond the requirements of 12.1.1.2, and that of bottom repair (12.1.7).	Delete "by the authorized inspector" and "approved by the authorized inspector".	
5	John Reynolds	Shell Global Solutions (US) Inc.	12.1.10.1	Editorial	This sentence needs clarification "A floatation test of the repaired roof may be performed as a method to verify the integrity of the roof"	Reword: "A floatation test of the repaired roof may be performed as an alternative method to verify the integrity of the roof"	
6	Nelson Acosta	HMT Inspection	12.1.10.1 & 12.3.2.6	Technical	Editorial correction and suggested revised wording.	12.1.10.1 In the last sentence, correct spelling of word "floatation" to "flotation". 12.3.2.6 suggest rewording as follows for better user understanding "Hydrostatic testing (full-height or flotation only) is not required for repairs made to the roof.	
7	Douglas Miller	Chicago Bridge & Iron Company(CB&I)	12.3.2	Editorial	12.3.2 is all about exceptions where you have a major repair/alteration but where 653 allows you to skip the h-test (refer to the first sentence of 12.3.2.1 to see this).	Expand the title of 12.3.2 to "When Hydrostatic Testing OF A MAJOR REPAIR OR ALTERATION is Not Required" This would make the title reflect the content of the section.	
8	Larry Hiner	Chicago Bridge & Iron Company(CB&I)	12.3.2.6	Technical	12.3.2.6 Affirmative comment - No change is required. A hydro test is required only for major repairs. Repairs to roofs are not considered major repairs.	Delete new 12.3.2.6	
9	Douglas Miller	Chicago Bridge & Iron Company(CB&I)	12.3.2.6	Technical	It is unnecessary to add a new 12.3.2.6 to state that h-test of floating roof repairs is not required. Further, this ADDS CONFUSION because 12.3.2 is all about exceptions where you have a major repair/alteration but where 653 allows you to skip the h-test (refer to the first sentence of 12.3.2.1 to see this). Here, you don't have a major repair in the first place.	Drop the new 12.3.2.6	

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 6 are compulsory.