

API Ballot Summary Sheet

4/16/2004

Ballot: 26-04: 653-185 - Repair of Tank Bottoms

AMS ID: 402

Start Date: 2/11/04

Closing Date: 4/1/04

Associate: Roland Goodman

Coordinator: Valeen Young

Proposal:

Vote Results

<u>Voter</u>	<u>Company</u>	<u>Comments</u>	<u>Vote Results</u>			
			<u>Affirmative</u>	<u>Negative</u>	<u>Abstain</u>	<u>Did Not Vote</u>
134629	Nelson Acosta	HMT Inspection	Yes	X		
138021	Moraya Al-Gahtani	Saudi Aramco	No			X
79326	Gregory Alvarado	Equity Engineering Group, Inc., The	No		X	
131617	Joel Andreani	Equity Engineering Group, Inc., The	No	X		
38921	Robert Annett	Alyeska Pipeline	No	X		
73074	Ronald Bailey	American Tank & Vessel, Inc.	Yes		X	
136219	Mark Baker	Baker Consulting Group, Inc.	Yes		X	
142888	Chris Bashor	Minnesota Pollution Control Agency	Yes	X		
134681	Ernie Blanchard	IMC-Phosphates	Yes	X		
135851	David Bryan	Marathon Ashland Petroleum, LLC	No	X		
130397	Jerry Burke	GE Panametrics	No			X
134782	Steve Caruthers	Tank Consultants, Inc.	Yes	X		
141258	John Cornell		No			X
7127	Earl Crochet	Kinder Morgan	No	X		
132217	Dwayne Davis	Stone & Webster	No			X
142685	Domingo de Para	ExxonMobil	Yes		X	
133403	Jeffrey DeArmond	BP p.l.c. Whiting Refinery	No	X		
133429	Robert Dolejs	UOP LLC	No			X
128480	Wayne Elliott	Elliott Services, Inc.	No	X		
135965	Kenneth Erdmann	Matrix Service Company	Yes		X	
128483	Robert Ferrell	The National Board of Boiler & Pressure	No	X		
133207	John Fiore	FTS, Inc.	No			X
105011	David Flight	Dow Chemical Company, The	No	X		
134870	Larry Foster	Marathon Ashland Petroleum LLC	Yes		X	
134880	John Fumbanks	Pond and Company Inc.	No	X		
133538	Frank Furillo	ExxonMobil	No	X		
115033	Alan Geis	Colonial Pipeline Company	No	X		

API Ballot Summary Sheet

4/16/2004

Ballot: 26-04: 653-185 - Repair of Tank Bottoms

AMS ID: 402

Start Date: 2/11/04

Closing Date: 4/1/04

Associate: Roland Goodman

Coordinator: Valeen Young

Proposal:

84365	Mark Geisenhoff	Flint Hills Resources, LP	Yes		X	
83689	Ty Hagen	Hagen Engineering International, Inc.	No	X		
133668	Gary Heath	All Tech Inspection	No	X		
70596	Marty Herlevic	James Machine Works, Inc.	No	X		
91812	Peter Hunt	Shell Chemical Company	No	X		
89501	Nyles Jones	Pro-Inspect Inc.	No	X		
93133	Randy Kissell	TGB Partnership	No	X		
26542	Morris Kline	HMT Inspection	No	X		
75330	Dennis Layman	BP p.l.c.	No	X		
81918	Manfred Lengsfeld		No	X		
135014	John Lieb	Tank Industry Consultants, Inc.	Yes	X		
136274	Thomas Lorentz	AEC Engineering, Inc.	No			X
128476	John Ludman	DuPont Engineering Technology	Yes		X	
135072	Francis Maitland	Quense LLC	No	X		
78399	David Martin	Conservatek Industries, Inc.	No			X
113545	James McBride	Petrex, Inc.	No	X		
138401	John McMillan	Mechanical Integrity Inc.	No			X
139443	James McVay	Tesoro Petroleum	No			X
137255	Carl Mikkola	Enbridge Energy Partners. L.P.	No			X
131185	Douglas Miller	Chicago Bridge & Iron Company (CB&I)	Yes		X	
114038	Ron Miller	Physical Acoustics Corporation	No			X
69609	Bhana Mistry	TIW Steel Platework	Yes	X		
83736	John Mooney		No	X		
92212	George Morovich	TEMCOR	No	X		
136286	Philip Myers	ChevronTexaco Corporation	No	X		
132210	David Nasab	Kellogg Brown & Root	No			X
140695	Richard Nichols	Roddey Engineering Services, Inc.	No			X
139601	John O'Brien	Innovative Research Consultants	No	X		
82544	John Oleyar	HMT, Inc.	No			X
82270	Robert Pechacek	General Electric Inspection Services, In	No			X
5193	Richard Pinegar	Cargill Inc.	No			X

API Ballot Summary Sheet

4/16/2004

Ballot: 26-04: 653-185 - Repair of Tank Bottoms

AMS ID: 402

Start Date: 2/11/04

Closing Date: 4/1/04

Associate: Roland Goodman

Coordinator: Valeen Young

Proposal:

102412	Roy Ralph	Petro-Canada	No	X		
10929	John Reynolds	Shell Global Solutions (US) Inc.	No	X		
135169	Michael Richardson	International Paper	No	X		
102879	James Riley	ChevronTexaco	No	X		
73744	Bruce Roberts		Yes		X	
102884	Joe Don Sanders	Lyondell Citgo Refinery	No			X
77480	Clinton Schulz	Citgo Refining & Chemical Co.	No			X
138135	Michael Shallis	Longview Inspection	No		X	
101360	Marilyn Shores	Sunoco Logistics	Yes		X	
145484	Ryan Sitton	Berwanger, Inc.	No			X
134219	James Slovacek	Suncor USA	No			X
132992	Robert Smallwood	DNV USA	No	X		
78185	Kelly Smith	ConocoPhillips	No	X		
126019	Larry Speaks	Mass Technology Corporation	No	X		
73144	Kenneth Tam		No	X		
134325	Donald Thain	Shell Global Solutions (US) Inc.	No	X		
137459	Roland Valdes	Inspection Solutions, LLC	No	X		
145034	Leith Watkins	Explorer Pipeline Company	No	X		
145896	Alan Watson	A. R. Watson USA	No	X		
134558	John Watson	The Dow Chemical Company	No	X		
135619	Steven Wells	Capstone Engineering Services, Inc.	No	X		
132209	Richard Whipple	Fluor, Inc.	No	X		

API Ballot Summary Sheet

4/16/2004

Ballot: 26-04: 653-185 - Repair of Tank Bottoms

AMS ID: 402

Start Date: 2/11/04

Closing Date: 4/1/04

Associate: Roland Goodman

Coordinator: Valeen Young

Proposal:

	<u>Affirmative</u>	<u>Negative</u>	<u>Abstain</u>	<u>Did Not Vote</u>
Balloting Totals:	47	10	6	17

Total Responses:	63	
Total Ballots:	80	
Response Rate :	59%	Must be > 50%
Approval Rate:	82%	Must be > 67%
Consensus:	YES	

API Template for Ballot Comments and Resolution

Ballot ID: 402	Date: April 16, 2004	Document: 26-04 653-185
----------------	----------------------	--------------------------------

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Voter/ Commenter	Company	Section No. (e.g. 3.1)	Type of comment	Proposed Change	Comment (justification for change)	Comment Resolution
Bruce Roberts			Technical	Subparagraph f seems misplaced. This section is about repairing defects using patch plates, not about adding reinforcement to existing designs. Suggest moving this paragraph to 9.10.2.1.7 for new bottoms and to ??? for new bottom plates. In other words, the addition of pads under accessories is to be considered when the existing bottom plate is being replaced. Otherwise, leave them alone.		
Ronald Bailey	American Tank & Vessel, Inc.		Technical		The new wording requires reinforcing or wear plates. This should be an option.	
Mark Baker	Baker Consulting Group, Inc.		Technical		The current API Standard allows installation of column and other appurtenances without installation of a bottom repad. If it is the intent of the committee to require repads with weld spacing requirements shown in API 653 Fig 9-5 retroactive to all tanks, then those requirements should be introduced into API Standard 650 first.	
Marilyn Shores	Sunoco Logistics		Technical		All items resting on or welded to the bottom of the tank shall be provided with reinforcing or wear plates, which shall may be installed welded on in accordance with this section or puttied in place if installed over an existing coating. This includes items such as columns, floating roof legs and mechanical vacuum breakers with legs (unless alternative measures are taken under API 650 H.4.6.6 or H.4.6.7), pipe supports, gaging datum plates, access ladders, hold-down chain anchor plates and any other item (not including the shell) resting on or connected to the floor.	
Steve Caruthers	Tank Consultants, Inc.		Technical	Paragraph 9.10.2.1.6 should also be changed to be consistent to the alternative measures allowed in API-650 H.4.6.6.		

API Template for Ballot Comments and Resolution

Ballot ID: 402	Date: April 16, 2004	Document: 26-04 653-185
----------------	----------------------	--------------------------------

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Voter/ Commenter	Company	Section No. (e.g. 3.1)	Type of comment	Proposed Change	Comment (justification for change)	Comment Resolution
Ernie Blanchard	IMC-Phosphates		Editorial		This is a good practice, that if had been implemented in earlier years, would have eliminated many floor leaks. We currently employ this practice.	
Chris Bashor	Minnesota Pollution Control Agency		Editorial		I think the requirement for wear plates might read better near the beginning of 9.10.1.1, as the second paragraph, along with the patch plate paragraph. This is prior to a, b, c, etc. which are how to actually do the plates.	
Bhana Mistry	TIW Steel Platework		Editorial		Editorial Type Comment to be sent shortly as an attachment.	
Nelson Acosta	HMT Inspection	9.10.1.1	Technical		It appears this item still references deleted text (subparagraph e) so added item f) is incorrectly identified (as would be any subsequent subparagraph items). Also, last sentence of added Subp. f) uses terms "anchorplates" and "floor" and should reference "anchor points" and "bottom".	
Mark Geisenhoff	Flint Hills Resources, LP	9.10.1.1	Technical		This addition does not seem to fit with section 9.10.1 The wording indicates it would require all existing tanks to be retrofitted to this practice?	
Kenneth Erdmann	Matrix Service Company	9.10.1.1 f	Technical	Either rewrite 9.10.1.1 to not specifically address repairs or patch plates but rather refer to generic plates welded to existing bottoms for either repairing the bottom or installing new items on or near the bottom. I would prefer that a new section be added that applies to new things added to existing bottoms in place of intermixing these with repairs to bottoms. Also, need to address 9.10.1.3 which seems to allow an engineer to disregard your new requirements.	I do not agree that any pad on an existing bottom must meet requirements that were initially intended to apply to repairs.	

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 6 are compulsory.

API Template for Ballot Comments and Resolution

Ballot ID: 402	Date: April 16, 2004	Document: 26-04 653-185
----------------	----------------------	--------------------------------

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Voter/ Commenter	Company	Section No. (e.g. 3.1)	Type of comment	Proposed Change	Comment (justification for change)	Comment Resolution
John Lieb	Tank Industry Consultants, Inc.	9.10.1.1.e	Editorial	"Anchorplates" should be two words.		
Douglas Miller	Chicago Bridge & Iron Company (CB&I)	9.10.1.1.f	Technical		We don't require reinforcing/wear plates at all these locations on new API 650 tanks. How can we now require them for old tanks? Is it intended that all existing tanks must be retrofitted to incorporate these details? When would conformance become mandatory? Seems like there are a lot of issues to work out on this.	
Larry Foster	Marathon Ashland Petroleum LLC	9.10.1.1.f	Technical	My preference is to drop the item, but if SGF thinks it is a good idea, modify to allow repads to be attached with epoxy.	<p>1. As proposed, the standard will require welded repads for all bottom attachments or items resting on the bottom. We often epoxy repads down for floating roof legs because of weld spacing issues.</p> <p>2. What is the technical justification for requiring a repad for items attached to or resting on the floor? API Std 650 doesn't require this.</p>	
Domingo de Para	ExxonMobil	9.10.1.1f	Technical	The proposal could say that if indications exist of bottom damage, wear plates are to be installed...	Seems like these requirements belong in API 650 for new construction.	
John Ludman	DuPont Engineering Technology	line f	Technical	I would recommend changing f to the following; "Items resting or welded to the bottom of tank may require reinforcement or wear plates"	Only the user can determine if reinforcing or wear plates are required. No procedure is given or suggested.	

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 6 are compulsory.