

API Ballot Summary Sheet

11/3/2005

Ballot: 37-05: 653-193, Requirements for Inspection of Repairs to Floating Roofs

AMS ID: 726

Start Date: 8/26/05

Closing Date: 10/26/05

Associate: Gordon Robertson

Coordinator: Gordon Robertson

Proposal:

Vote Results

<u>Voter</u>	<u>Company</u>	<u>Comments</u>	<u>Vote Results</u>			
			<u>Affirmative</u>	<u>Negative</u>	<u>Abstain</u>	<u>Did Not Vote</u>
134629	Nelson Acosta	HMT Inspection	No	X		
138021	Moraya Al-Gahtani	Saudi Aramco	No	X		
79326	Gregory Alvarado	Equity Engineering Group, Inc., The	No	X		
131617	Joel Andreani	Equity Engineering Group, Inc., The	No	X		
38921	Robert Annett	Alyeska Pipeline	No	X		
73074	Ronald Bailey	American Tank & Vessel, Inc.	No	X		
136219	Mark Baker	Baker Consulting Group, Inc.	No	X		
142888	Chris Bashor	Minnesota Pollution Control Agency	No	X		
134681	Ernie Blanchard	MOSAIC	No	X		
109375	Jerry Boldra	SBC Global	Yes	X		
22200	Dan Boley	DJA Inspection Services	No	X		
135851	David Bryan	Marathon Petroleum Company LLC	Yes		X	
134782	Steve Caruthers	Tank Consultants, Inc.	No	X		
154212	Gary Cavey	Conservatek Industries, Inc.	Yes		X	
7127	Earl Crochet	Kinder Morgan	No	X		
150217	Jody Day	Lide Industries, Inc.	No			X
142685	Domingo de Para	ExxonMobil	No			X
133403	Jeffrey DeArmond	BP p.l.c. Whiting Refinery	No	X		
146748	Terry Delong	Terasen Pipelines (USA) Inc.	Yes	X		
133429	Robert Dolejs	UOP LLC	No	X		
128480	Wayne Elliott	Elliott Services, Inc.	No	X		
135965	Kenneth Erdmann	Matrix Service Company	No	X		
128483	Robert Ferrell	The National Board of Boiler & Pressure	No	X		
133207	John Fiore	FTS, Inc.	No	X		
105011	David Flight	Dow Chemical Company	No			X
134870	Laurence Foster	Marathon Ashland Petroleum LLC	No	X		
134880	John Fumbanks	Pond and Company Inc.	No			X

API Ballot Summary Sheet

11/3/2005

Ballot: 37-05: 653-193, Requirements for Inspection of Repairs to Floating Roofs

AMS ID: 726

Start Date: 8/26/05

Closing Date: 10/26/05

Associate: Gordon Robertson

Coordinator: Gordon Robertson

Proposal:

133538	Frank Furillo	ExxonMobil Corp.	No	X	
115033	Alan Geis	Colonial Pipeline Company	No	X	
84365	Mark Geisenhoff	Flint Hills Resources	No		X
83689	Ty Hagen	Hagen Engineering International, Inc.	No	X	
133668	Gary Heath	All Tech Inspection	No	X	
136619	Robert Hendrix	Eastman Chemical Co	No	X	
70596	Marty Herlevic	James Machine Works, Inc.	No	X	
91812	Peter Hunt	Shell Chemical Company	No	X	
89501	N. Jones	Pro-Inspect Inc.	No	X	
93133	Randy Kissell	TGB Partnership	Yes	X	
26542	Morris Kline	HMT Inspection	No	X	
135705	Owen Konski	Syncrude Canada Ltd.	No		X
75330	Dennis Layman	BP p.l.c.	No	X	
81918	Manfred Lengsfeld		No	X	
135014	John Lieb	Tank Industry Consultants, Inc.	No	X	
136274	Thomas Lorentz	AEC Engineering, Inc.	No		X
128476	John Ludman	E.I. Dupont De Nemours & Co.	No	X	
135072	Francis Maitland	Quense LLC	No	X	
113545	James McBride	Petrex, Inc.	No	X	
138401	John McMillan	Mechanical Integrity Inc.	No	X	
139045	Craig Meier	ConocoPhillips	No		X
137255	Carl Mikkola	Enbridge Energy Partners, L.P.	No	X	
131185	Douglas Miller	Chicago Bridge & Iron Company(CB&I)	Yes	X	
69609	Bhana Mistry	TIW Steel Platework	No	X	
83736	John Mooney		No	X	
92212	George Morovich	TEMCOR	No	X	
136286	Philip Myers	Chevron Corporation	Yes	X	
132210	David Nasab	Kellogg Brown & Root	No	X	
140695	Richard Nichols	Roddey Engineering Services, Inc.	No	X	
139601	John O'Brien	itcSkills	No	X	
82544	John Oleyar	HMT, Inc.	No	X	

API Ballot Summary Sheet

11/3/2005

Ballot: 37-05: 653-193, Requirements for Inspection of Repairs to Floating Roofs

AMS ID: 726

Start Date: 8/26/05

Closing Date: 10/26/05

Associate: Gordon Robertson

Coordinator: Gordon Robertson

Proposal:

82270	Robert Pechacek	General Electric Inspection Services, In	No	X	
5193	Richard Pinegar	Cargill Inc.	No		X
102412	Roy Ralph	Petro-Canada	No	X	
10929	John Reynolds	Shell Global Solutions (US) Inc.	No	X	
135169	Michael Richardson	International Paper	No	X	
102879	James Riley	Chevron Corporation Energy Technology	No	X	
73744	Bruce Roberts		Yes	X	
102884	Joe Don Sanders	Lyondell Citgo Refinery	No		X
134414	Roy Schubert	Shell Canada Ltd.	No	X	
138135	Michael Shallis	Longview Inspection, Inc.	No	X	
101360	Marilyn Shores	Sunoco Logistics	No	X	
145484	Ryan Sitton	Berwanger, Inc.	No		X
132992	Robert Smallwood	DNV USA	No	X	
78185	Kelly Smith	ConocoPhillips	No	X	
126019	Larry Speaks	Mass Technology Corporation	No	X	
73144	Kenneth Tam		Yes	X	
134314	Tearle Taylor	Flint Hills Resources	No	X	
134325	Donald Thain	Shell Global Solutions (US) Inc.	No	X	
137459	Roland Valdes	Inspection Solutions, LLC	No		X
145034	Leith Watkins	Explorer Pipeline Company	No	X	
145896	Alan Watson	A.R. Watson, USA	No	X	
134558	John Watson	The Dow Chemical Company	No	X	
135619	Steven Wells	Capstone Engineering Services, Inc.	No		X
132209	Richard Whipple	Fluor, Inc.	No	X	

API Ballot Summary Sheet

11/3/2005

**Ballot: 37-05: 653-193, Requirements for Inspection of Repairs to Floating
Roofs**

AMS ID: 726

Start Date: 8/26/05

Closing Date: 10/26/05

Associate: Gordon Robertson

Coordinator: Gordon Robertson

Proposal:

	<u>Affirmative</u>	<u>Negative</u>	<u>Abstain</u>	<u>Did Not Vote</u>
Balloting Totals:	67	2	0	13

Total Responses:	69			
Total Ballots:	82			
Response Rate :	82%		Must be > 50%	
Approval Rate:	97%		Must be > 67%	
Consensus:	YES			

API Ballot Summary Sheet

11/3/2005

Ballot: 37-05: 653-193, Requirements for Inspection of Repairs to Floating
Roofs

AMS ID: 726

Start Date: 8/26/05

Closing Date: 10/26/05

Associate: Gordon Robertson

Coordinator: Gordon Robertson

Proposal:

API Template for Ballot Comments and Resolution

Ballot ID: 726	Date: November 3, 2005	Document: 37-05-653-193
----------------	------------------------	--------------------------------

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
#	Voter/ Commenter	Company	Section No. (e.g. 3.1)	Type of comment	Comment (justification for change)	Proposed Change	Comment Resolution
1	Bruce Roberts			Technical	653 should not refer to Appendix T (not F) for NDE requirements.	In 12.1.10.1b, delete: (Refer to Appendix F – NDE Requirements Summary).	
2	Philip Myers	Chevron Corporation		Technical	I think the default case should be clearly a "floatation test" and as an alternative, use 12.1.10.1 a) and b). Also, believe you need to be more clear about what is deemed a "major repair" in 12.3.2.6 as this term conflicts with the definition of "major repair" for a hydrostatic test.		
3	Gary Cavey	Conservatek Industries, Inc.		Technical	Rationale is confusing an requires further clarification. Perhaps, a suggestion or a direction on "when and/or if" hydro-testing should be required.		

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 6 are compulsory.

API *electronic balloting commenting template/version 2002-12*

API Template for Ballot Comments and Resolution

Ballot ID: 726	Date: November 3, 2005	Document: 37-05-653-193
----------------	------------------------	-------------------------

#	(1) Voter/ Commenter	(2) Company	(3) Section No. (e.g. 3.1)	(4) Type of comment	(5) Comment (justification for change)	(6) Proposed Change	(7) Comment Resolution
4	Jerry Boldra	SBC Global		Technical	<p>Great item and it is needed too. The Affirmative comments below are mainly formatting.</p> <p>Take a deep breath . . . my comments are long and detailed ¡V SORRY.</p> <p>1. The paragraph number of the ¡§proposal¡¨ title is: 9.12. The subsequent section is 12.1.9. How did we jump from Section 9 to Section 12 ??</p> <p>2. What happened to the existing, one-sentence TEXT under heading 12.1.9 ? It appears that it has been deleted, but it applies to fixed roofs as well as floating roofs. I¡m hoping that it still remains in the document . . . with one exception --> paragraph 5.3.7 is no longer in API 650. Delete the reference to 5.3.7.</p> <p>3. There are three titles without any text in between. At least one title should be deleted.</p> <p>The three titles are 12.1.9, 12.1.10, and 12.1.10.1. Suggest deleting 12.1.10.1 for the following reasons: (A) Delete this title for consistency with all other titles in Chapter 12, i.e. no other titles in Chapter 12 have the word ¡§Repair¡¨. Chapter 12 is all about ¡§Examination & Testing¡¨; Chapter 9 is about ¡§Repairs¡¨ (B) Also, the word ¡§repair¡¨ is the second word in the proposed text. (C) Nothing is lost by deleting the title, and simplification is gained.</p> <p>4. If Item 3 above is accepted, skip to Item 5.</p> <p>5. The title of 12.1.10.1 says ¡§Repair Work to Steel Floating Roofs¡¨. Aluminum and fiberglass floating roofs are not addressed, yet almost everything proposed in this agenda item also applies to aluminum or fiberglass floating roofs. The one exception is addressed in item 5 below. Delete the word ¡§steel¡¨ from the title.</p> <p>6. In (a), ¡§. . . from the top and bottom side . . .¡¨ „² should be plural, i.e. ¡§sides¡¨</p> <p>7. The last part of Item ¡§b¡¨ under</p>	<p>PROPOSED TEXT</p> <p>12.1.9 Roofs</p> <p>Newly welded roof joints and repairs shall be examined in accordance with API 650, paragraph 5.3.2.2</p> <p>12.1.10 Floating roofs</p> <p>After repair work is complete:</p> <p>(a) Perform a visual examination from the top and bottom sides of the floating roof.</p> <p>(b) Perform an air leak, vacuum box, penetrating oil, tracer gas, or other applicable non destructive test of the repairs. (Refer to Appendix F ¡V NDE Requirements Summary)</p> <p>As an alternative to (b), conduct a floatation test of the repaired roof. The use of a floatation test, and the use of water or product shall be by agreement between the owner and contractor. Examination and acceptance criteria for NDE shall be in accordance with 12.1.</p> <p>12.3.2 When Hyrostatic Testing is not Required.</p> <p>12.3.2.6 Repair to Floating Roofs</p> <p>Repair to floating roofs is not considered a major repair.</p> <p>12.3.2.7 Fitness for Service Evaluation</p> <p>(no change)</p>	

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 6 are compulsory.

API electronic balloting commenting template/version 2002-12

API Template for Ballot Comments and Resolution

Ballot ID: 726	Date: November 3, 2005	Document: 37-05-653-193
----------------	------------------------	--------------------------------

#	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	Voter/ Commenter	Company	Section No. (e.g. 3.1)	Type of comment	Comment (justification for change)	Proposed Change	Comment Resolution
5	David Bryan	Marathon Petroleum Company LLC		Technical	We sometimes do nothing more than a visual after repairs and beleive this is adequate.		
6	Douglas Miller	Chicago Bridge & Iron Company(CB&I)		Editorial	We don't need two headings 12.1.10 and 12.1.10.1	Delete the heading "12.1.10.1"	
7	Kenneth Tam			Editorial	<p>Editorial comment:</p> <p>1. Since there will be only one subparagraph to 12.1.10, I don't believe we need to have a subparagraph 12.1.10.1 unless we intend to develop another subparagraph. Thus, we can start the paragraph by saying: "After repair work is completed on a steel floating roof:" and delete "12.1.10.1 Repair....."</p> <p>2. Are we going to develop requirements for floating roof other than steel?</p> <p>3. Recommend changing, in the last sentence, 12.1 to 12.1.1 to read " In accordance with 12.1.1" because 12.1 includes other type of repairs.</p> <p>Kenneth Tam Phone: 281-282-0455</p>		
8	Terry Delong	Terasen Pipelines (USA) Inc.	12.1.10.1	Technical	Is there a definition for floatation test (duration, etc.)?		
9	Randy Kissell	TGB Partnership	12.1.10.1	Technical	Change "flotation test" to "hydrostatic test" to be consistent with terminology used elsewhere.		
10	Randy Kissell	TGB Partnership	12.1.10.1	Technical	After "a)Perform a visual examination from the top and bottom side of the floating roof", add "and" to clarify that both a) and b) must be done.		

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 6 are compulsory.

API electronic balloting commenting template/version 2002-12

API Template for Ballot Comments and Resolution

Ballot ID: 726	Date: November 3, 2005	Document: 37-05-653-193
----------------	------------------------	--------------------------------

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
#	Voter/ Commenter	Company	Section No. (e.g. 3.1)	Type of comment	Comment (justification for change)	Proposed Change	Comment Resolution
11	Douglas Miller	Chicago Bridge & Iron Company(CB&I)	12.1.10.1	Editorial	In earlier version of this agenda item, we had special requirement for AI to do visual examination. Comment was made that we should not go beyond the requirements of 12.1.1. I agree with that, but the requirements of 12.1.1 apply without invoking them. So the last sentence of 12.1.10.1 is unnecessary.	Delete last sentence of 12.1.10.1	
12	Randy Kissell	TGB Partnership	12.1.9	Technical	Don't we need content for 12.1.9 Fixed Roofs?		
13	Douglas Miller	Chicago Bridge & Iron Company(CB&I)	12.1.9	Editorial	Existing text needs an editorial correction.	Reference should be to 5.3.6, not 5.3.7	

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 6 are compulsory.

API *electronic balloting commenting template/version 2002-12*

#	(1) Voter/ Commenter	(2) Company	(3) Section No. (e.g. 3.1)	(4) Type of comment	(5) Comment (justification for change)	(6) Proposed Change	(7) Comment Resolution
14	Jerry Boldra	SBC Global	12.1.9 thru 12.1.10; and 12.3.6	Editorial	<p>1. The paragraph number of the "proposal" title is: 9.12. The subsequent section is 12.1.9. How did we jump from Section 9 to Section 12 ??</p> <p>2. What happened to the existing, one-sentence TEXT under heading 12.1.9 ? It appears that it has been deleted, but it applies to fixed roofs as well as floating roofs. I'm hoping that it still remains in the document . . . with one exception --> paragraph 5.3.7 is no longer in API 650. Delete the reference to 5.3.7.</p> <p>3. There are three titles without any text in between. At least one title should be deleted.</p> <p>The three titles are 12.1.9, 12.1.10, and 12.1.10.1. Suggest deleting 12.1.10.1 for the following reasons: (A) Delete this title for consistency with all other titles in Chapter 12, i.e. no other titles in Chapter 12 have the word "Repair". Chapter 12 is all about "Examination & Testing"; Chapter 9 is about "Repairs" (B) Also, the word "repair" is the second word in the proposed text. (C) Nothing is lost by deleting the title, and simplification is gained.</p> <p>4. If Item 3 above is accepted, skip to Item 5.</p> <p>5. The title of 12.1.10.1 says "Repair Work to Steel Floating Roofs". Aluminum and fiberglass floating roofs are not addressed, yet almost everything proposed in this agenda item also applies to aluminum or fiberglass floating roofs. The one exception is addressed in item 5 below. Delete the word "steel" from the title.</p> <p>6. In (a), " . . . from the top and bottom side . . ." should be plural, i.e. "sides"</p> <p>7. The last part of Item 5(b) under 12.1.10.1 says, " . . . tracer gas, or other applicable non destructive test of the repaired welds." These last two words imply that only existing welds will be repaired. Many times new welds are used to make repairs, e.g. patch plates over thin</p>	<p>PROPOSED CHANGES</p> <p>12.1.9 Roofs Newly welded roof joints and repairs shall be examined in accordance with API 650, paragraph 5.3.2.2</p> <p>12.1.10 Floating roofs After repair work is complete: (a) Perform a visual examination from the top and bottom sides of the floating roof. (b) Perform an air leak, vacuum box, penetrating oil, tracer gas, or other applicable non destructive test of the repairs. (Refer to Appendix F V NDE Requirements Summary)</p> <p>As an alternative to (b), conduct a floatation test of the repaired roof. The use of a floatation test, and the use of water or product shall be by agreement between the owner and contractor. Examination and acceptance criteria for NDE shall be in accordance with 12.1.</p> <p>12.3.2 When Hydrostatic Testing is not Required. 12.3.2.6 Repair to Floating Roofs Repair to floating roofs is not considered a major repair.</p> <p>12.3.2.7 Fitness for Service Evaluation (no change)</p>	

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 6 are compulsory.
API electronic balloting commenting template/version 2002-12

API Template for Ballot Comments and Resolution

Ballot ID: 726	Date: November 3, 2005	Document: 37-05-653-193
----------------	------------------------	--------------------------------

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
#	Voter/ Commenter	Company	Section No. (e.g. 3.1)	Type of comment	Comment (justification for change)	Proposed Change	Comment Resolution
15	Douglas Miller	Chicago Bridge & Iron Company(CB&I)	12.3.6.2	Technical	As I have noted in past ballots. Creating new section 12.3.2.6 creates serious confusion regarding the structure and meaning of section 12.3.2. 12.3.2, up to now, has been a list of cases that are defined as major repair/alterations but are given exemption from h-test. New 12.3.2.6 is not a major repair in the first place.	As agreed at S05 meeting, new agenda item 653-205 is to fix this problem. But it has not yet been balloted. Therefore 653-193 should only be passed if there is commitment to get 653-205 passed quickly.	

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 6 are compulsory.

API electronic balloting commenting template/version 2002-12