

API Ballot Summary Sheet

10/21/2005

Ballot: 46-05: 650-476, Undercut Tolerance for Shell-to-Bottom Welds

AMS ID: 735

Start Date: 8/26/05

Closing Date: 10/12/05

Associate: Gordon Robertson

Coordinator: Gordon Robertson

Proposal:

Vote Results

<u>Voter</u>	<u>Company</u>	<u>Comments</u>	<u>Vote Results</u>			
			<u>Affirmative</u>	<u>Negative</u>	<u>Abstain</u>	<u>Did Not Vote</u>
134629	Nelson Acosta	HMT Inspection	No	X		
131617	Joel Andreani	Equity Engineering Group, Inc., The	No	X		
38921	Robert Annett	Alyeska Pipeline	No	X		
73074	Ronald Bailey	American Tank & Vessel, Inc.	No	X		
136219	Mark Baker	Baker Consulting Group, Inc.	Yes	X		
142888	Chris Bashor	Minnesota Pollution Control Agency	No			X
134681	Ernie Blanchard	MOSAIC	No	X		
109375	Jerry Boldra	SBC Global	No	X		
22200	Dan Boley	DJA Inspection Services	No	X		
134782	Steve Caruthers	Tank Consultants, Inc.	No			X
154212	Gary Cavey	Conservatek Industries, Inc.	No		X	
7127	Earl Crochet	Kinder Morgan	No	X		
150217	Jody Day	Lide Industries, Inc.	No			X
142685	Domingo de Para	ExxonMobil	No	X		
133403	Jeffrey DeArmond	BP p.l.c. Whiting Refinery	No	X		
146748	Terry Delong	Terasen Pipelines (USA) Inc.	No	X		
135965	Kenneth Erdmann	Matrix Service Company	Yes		X	
105011	David Flight	Dow Chemical Company	No			X
134870	Laurence Foster	Marathon Ashland Petroleum LLC	No	X		
134880	John Fumbanks	Pond and Company Inc.	No			X
115033	Alan Geis	Colonial Pipeline Company	No	X		
83689	Ty Hagen	Hagen Engineering International, Inc.	No	X		
136619	Robert Hendrix	Eastman Chemical Co	No	X		
70596	Marty Herlevic	James Machine Works, Inc.	Yes		X	
93133	Randy Kissell	TGB Partnership	No	X		
81918	Manfred Lengsfeld		No	X		
135014	John Lieb	Tank Industry Consultants, Inc.	No	X		

API Ballot Summary Sheet

10/21/2005

Ballot: 46-05: 650-476, Undercut Tolerance for Shell-to-Bottom Welds

AMS ID: 735

Start Date: 8/26/05

Closing Date: 10/12/05

Associate: Gordon Robertson

Coordinator: Gordon Robertson

Proposal:

136274	Thomas Lorentz	AEC Engineering, Inc.	No	X	
135072	Francis Maitland	Quense LLC	No		X
113545	James McBride	Petrex, Inc.	No	X	
139045	Craig Meier	ConocoPhillips	No		X
137255	Carl Mikkola	Enbridge Energy Partners, L.P.	No	X	
131185	Douglas Miller	Chicago Bridge & Iron Company(CB&I)	No	X	
69609	Bhana Mistry	TIW Steel Platework	No	X	
83736	John Mooney		No	X	
92212	George Morovich	TEMCOR	No	X	
136286	Philip Myers	Chevron Corporation	No	X	
132210	David Nasab	Kellogg Brown & Root	No	X	
82544	John Oleyar	HMT, Inc.	No	X	
5193	Richard Pinegar	Cargill Inc.	No		X
102412	Roy Ralph	Petro-Canada	No		X
135169	Michael Richardson	International Paper	Yes	X	
73744	Bruce Roberts		No	X	
101360	Marilyn Shores	Sunoco Logistics	No	X	
126019	Larry Speaks	Mass Technology Corporation	No	X	
134314	Tearle Taylor	Flint Hills Resources	No	X	
134325	Donald Thain	Shell Global Solutions (US) Inc.	No	X	
145034	Leith Watkins	Explorer Pipeline Company	No	X	
145896	Alan Watson	A.R. Watson, USA	No	X	
132209	Richard Whipple	Fluor, Inc.	Yes	X	

API Ballot Summary Sheet

10/21/2005

Ballot: 46-05: 650-476, Undercut Tolerance for Shell-to-Bottom Welds

AMS ID: 735

Start Date: 8/26/05

Closing Date: 10/12/05

Associate: Gordon Robertson

Coordinator: Gordon Robertson

Proposal:

	<u>Affirmative</u>	<u>Negative</u>	<u>Abstain</u>	<u>Did Not Vote</u>
Balloting Totals:	38	2	1	9

Total Responses:	41	
Total Ballots:	50	
Response Rate :	76%	Must be > 50%
Approval Rate:	95%	Must be > 67%
Consensus:	YES	

API Ballot Summary Sheet

10/21/2005

Ballot: 46-05: 650-476, Undercut Tolerance for Shell-to-Bottom Welds

AMS ID: 735

Start Date: 8/26/05

Closing Date: 10/12/05

Associate: Gordon Robertson

Coordinator: Gordon Robertson

Proposal:

API Ballot Comments Sheet

10/21/2005

Ballot: 46-05: 650-476, Undercut Tolerance for Shell-to-Bottom Welds

Start Date: 8/26/05

Closing Date: 10/12/05

AMS Ballot ID: 735

Associate: Gordon Robertson

Coordinator: Gordon Robertson

Proposal:

136219 Mark Baker

Baker Consulting Group, Inc.

Specification Section

Type

Comment

Suggested Change

5.2.1.4

Other

You do not address the exterior shell-to-bottom weld in your list. I believe that this will add confusion to the user of the standard and should be addressed.

Please consider using the term interior shell-to-bottom weld and exterior shell-to-bottom weld.

135965 Kenneth Erdmann

Matrix Service Company

Specification Section

Type

Comment

Suggested Change

5.2.1.4

Technical

Permanent attachments should use 1/32" on all welds for undercut. There is no justification for placing the same tolerance on an attachment as on a vertical butt weld.

Delete reference to permanent attachments in the vertical weld section and state that all welds for permanent attachments shall have a maximum permissible weld undercut limit of 1/32".

70596 Marty Herlevic

James Machine Works, Inc.

Specification Section

Type

Comment

Suggested Change

Technical

I feel the undercut tolerance for the shell-to-bottom weld should be 1/32 inch in lieu of 1/64 inch considering the shell-to-bottom weld is oriented horizontal rather than vertical. This would make the undercut tolerances consistent.

API Ballot Comments Sheet

10/21/2005

135169 Michael Richardson

International Paper

<u>Specification Section</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Comment</u>	<u>Suggested Change</u>
General	Technical	<p>I would recommended that the "inside" for the shell-to-bottom weld be deleted. I am not sure what stress difference their is between the inside and outside.</p> <p>I would recommended the phase "shall" instead of "does"</p>	<p>API-650 5.2.1.4</p> <p>... flush-type openings, and the shell-to-bottom weld. For horizontal butt joints, ...</p> <p>API-650 6.5.1.b</p> <p>Weld undercut shall not exceed the limits given in 5.2.1.4</p> <p>...</p>

132209 Richard Whipple

Fluor, Inc.

<u>Specification Section</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Comment</u>	<u>Suggested Change</u>
Proposal	Technical	Suggested comments are for clarity.	<p>Instead of "inside shell to bottom welds" change to "shell to bottom welds".</p> <p>Change the last sentence to "Weld undercut shall not exceed...."</p>

API Ballot Comments Sheet

10/21/2005
