

# API Ballot Summary Sheet

10/21/2005

**Ballot: 45-05: 653-120, Undercut Tolerance for Shell-to-Bottom Welds**

**AMS ID: 734**

**Start Date:** 8/26/05

**Closing Date:** 10/12/05

**Associate:** Gordon Robertson

**Coordinator:** Gordon Robertson

**Proposal:**

## Vote Results

| <u>Voter</u> | <u>Company</u>    | <u>Comments</u>                       | <u>Vote Results</u> |                 |                |                     |
|--------------|-------------------|---------------------------------------|---------------------|-----------------|----------------|---------------------|
|              |                   |                                       | <u>Affirmative</u>  | <u>Negative</u> | <u>Abstain</u> | <u>Did Not Vote</u> |
| 134629       | Nelson Acosta     | HMT Inspection                        | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 131617       | Joel Andreani     | Equity Engineering Group, Inc., The   | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 38921        | Robert Annett     | Alyeska Pipeline                      | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 73074        | Ronald Bailey     | American Tank & Vessel, Inc.          | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 136219       | Mark Baker        | Baker Consulting Group, Inc.          | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 142888       | Chris Bashor      | Minnesota Pollution Control Agency    | No                  |                 |                | X                   |
| 134681       | Ernie Blanchard   | MOSAIC                                | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 109375       | Jerry Boldra      | SBC Global                            | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 22200        | Dan Boley         | DJA Inspection Services               | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 134782       | Steve Caruthers   | Tank Consultants, Inc.                | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 154212       | Gary Cavey        | Conservatek Industries, Inc.          | No                  |                 | X              |                     |
| 7127         | Earl Crochet      | Kinder Morgan                         | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 150217       | Jody Day          | Lide Industries, Inc.                 | No                  |                 |                | X                   |
| 142685       | Domingo de Para   | ExxonMobil                            | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 133403       | Jeffrey DeArmond  | BP p.l.c. Whiting Refinery            | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 146748       | Terry Delong      | Terasen Pipelines (USA) Inc.          | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 135965       | Kenneth Erdmann   | Matrix Service Company                | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 105011       | David Flight      | Dow Chemical Company                  | No                  |                 |                | X                   |
| 134870       | Laurence Foster   | Marathon Ashland Petroleum LLC        | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 134880       | John Fumbanks     | Pond and Company Inc.                 | No                  |                 |                | X                   |
| 115033       | Alan Geis         | Colonial Pipeline Company             | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 83689        | Ty Hagen          | Hagen Engineering International, Inc. | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 136619       | Robert Hendrix    | Eastman Chemical Co                   | Yes                 | X               |                |                     |
| 70596        | Marty Herlevic    | James Machine Works, Inc.             | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 93133        | Randy Kissell     | TGB Partnership                       | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 81918        | Manfred Lengsfeld |                                       | No                  | X               |                |                     |
| 135014       | John Lieb         | Tank Industry Consultants, Inc.       | No                  | X               |                |                     |

# API Ballot Summary Sheet

10/21/2005

**Ballot: 45-05: 653-120, Undercut Tolerance for Shell-to-Bottom Welds**

**AMS ID: 734**

**Start Date:** 8/26/05

**Closing Date:** 10/12/05

**Associate:** Gordon Robertson

**Coordinator:** Gordon Robertson

**Proposal:**

|        |                    |                                     |     |   |   |
|--------|--------------------|-------------------------------------|-----|---|---|
| 136274 | Thomas Lorentz     | AEC Engineering, Inc.               | No  | X |   |
| 135072 | Francis Maitland   | Quense LLC                          | No  |   | X |
| 113545 | James McBride      | Petrex, Inc.                        | No  | X |   |
| 139045 | Craig Meier        | ConocoPhillips                      | No  |   | X |
| 137255 | Carl Mikkola       | Enbridge Energy Partners, L.P.      | No  | X |   |
| 131185 | Douglas Miller     | Chicago Bridge & Iron Company(CB&I) | No  | X |   |
| 69609  | Bhana Mistry       | TIW Steel Platework                 | No  | X |   |
| 83736  | John Mooney        |                                     | Yes | X |   |
| 92212  | George Morovich    | TEMCOR                              | No  | X |   |
| 136286 | Philip Myers       | Chevron Corporation                 | No  | X |   |
| 132210 | David Nasab        | Kellogg Brown & Root                | No  | X |   |
| 82544  | John Oleyar        | HMT, Inc.                           | No  | X |   |
| 5193   | Richard Pinegar    | Cargill Inc.                        | No  |   | X |
| 102412 | Roy Ralph          | Petro-Canada                        | No  |   | X |
| 135169 | Michael Richardson | International Paper                 | Yes | X |   |
| 73744  | Bruce Roberts      |                                     | Yes | X |   |
| 101360 | Marilyn Shores     | Sunoco Logistics                    | No  | X |   |
| 126019 | Larry Speaks       | Mass Technology Corporation         | No  | X |   |
| 134314 | Tearle Taylor      | Flint Hills Resources               | No  | X |   |
| 134325 | Donald Thain       | Shell Global Solutions (US) Inc.    | No  | X |   |
| 145034 | Leith Watkins      | Explorer Pipeline Company           | No  | X |   |
| 145896 | Alan Watson        | A.R. Watson, USA                    | No  | X |   |
| 132209 | Richard Whipple    | Fluor, Inc.                         | Yes |   | X |

# API Ballot Summary Sheet

10/21/2005

**Ballot: 45-05: 653-120, Undercut Tolerance for Shell-to-Bottom Welds**

**AMS ID: 734**

**Start Date:** 8/26/05

**Closing Date:** 10/12/05

**Associate:** Gordon Robertson

**Coordinator:** Gordon Robertson

**Proposal:**

|                          | <u>Affirmative</u> | <u>Negative</u> | <u>Abstain</u> | <u>Did Not Vote</u> |
|--------------------------|--------------------|-----------------|----------------|---------------------|
| <b>Balloting Totals:</b> | <b>40</b>          | <b>1</b>        | <b>1</b>       | <b>8</b>            |

|                         |            |  |               |  |
|-------------------------|------------|--|---------------|--|
| <b>Total Responses:</b> | <b>42</b>  |  |               |  |
| <b>Total Ballots:</b>   | <b>50</b>  |  |               |  |
| <b>Response Rate :</b>  | <b>80%</b> |  | Must be > 50% |  |
| <b>Approval Rate:</b>   | <b>98%</b> |  | Must be > 67% |  |
| <b>Consensus:</b>       | <b>YES</b> |  |               |  |

# API Ballot Summary Sheet

10/21/2005

---

**Ballot:** 45-05: 653-120, Undercut Tolerance for Shell-to-Bottom Welds

**AMS ID:** 734

**Start Date:** 8/26/05

**Closing Date:** 10/12/05

**Associate:** Gordon Robertson

**Coordinator:** Gordon Robertson

**Proposal:**

# API Template for Ballot Comments and Resolution

|                |                        |                                |
|----------------|------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Ballot ID: 734 | Date: November 4, 2005 | Document: <b>45-05-653-120</b> |
|----------------|------------------------|--------------------------------|

| # | (1)<br>Voter/<br>Commenter | (2)<br>Company      | (3)<br>Section No.<br>(e.g. 3.1) | (4)<br>Type of<br>comment | (5)<br>Comment (justification for change)   | (6)<br>Proposed Change   | (7)<br>Comment Resolution |
|---|----------------------------|---------------------|----------------------------------|---------------------------|---|--|---------------------------|
| 1 | John Mooney                |                     |                                  | Technical                 | Where in API 650 Section 5 is shell to bottom undercut mentioned?   |  |                           |
| 2 | Bruce Roberts              |                     |                                  | Technical                 | Paragraph 1.1.5 of 653 would cover the fact that the rules in 650 apply, without calling them out as proposed in this item. However, the typical reader probably would not realize this, thus I vote YES without further comment.   |  |                           |
| 3 | Robert Hendrix             | Eastman Chemical Co |                                  | Technical                 | Is it very clear that these tolerances apply only to "new" welds involved in reconstruction (Section 10) as proposed? If they are to be applied for alterations and repairs as well, then they may be need to referenced elsewhere. As originally proposed, only the shell-to-bottom weld was of new interest.  |  |                           |
| 4 | Michael Richardson         | International Paper | General                          | Technical                 | I would recommend the use of the word "angle" instead of "edge" to denote the weld toe.   | API-653 10.4.2.5<br><br>The edges of all welds shall merge smoothly with the surface of the plate without a sharp angle. Maximum ...   |                           |
| 5 | Richard Whipple            | Fluor, Inc.         | Proposal                         | Technical                 | The recommended modification does not address undercut limits for shell to bottom welds because the paragraphs listed only covers butt joints. The shell to bottom weld is not a butt joint but a double fillet joint.<br><br>One may argue that the shell to bottom undercut tolerance is already covered in API 653, Section 12.1.1.3 which states "Acceptance criteria shall be in accordance with API 650 ...." | If a modification is necessary, I suggest:<br><br>The edges of all welds shall merge with the surface of the plate without a sharp angle. Maximum permissible weld undercut shall be in accordance with API-650, Sections 5.4.2.5 and 6.5.1.b. |                           |

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 6 are compulsory.

API electronic balloting commenting template/version 2002-12