

API Ballot Summary Sheet

10/21/2005

Ballot: 40-05: 653-207, Cutting Shell-to-Bottom Weld

AMS ID: 729

Start Date: 8/26/05

Closing Date: 10/7/05

Associate: Gordon Robertson

Coordinator: Gordon Robertson

Proposal:

Vote Results

<u>Voter</u>	<u>Company</u>	<u>Comments</u>	<u>Vote Results</u>			
			<u>Affirmative</u>	<u>Negative</u>	<u>Abstain</u>	<u>Did Not Vote</u>
134629	Nelson Acosta	HMT Inspection		X		
131617	Joel Andreani	Equity Engineering Group, Inc., The	X			
38921	Robert Annett	Alyeska Pipeline	X			
73074	Ronald Bailey	American Tank & Vessel, Inc.	X			
136219	Mark Baker	Baker Consulting Group, Inc.	X			
142888	Chris Bashor	Minnesota Pollution Control Agency	X			
134681	Ernie Blanchard	MOSAIC	X			
109375	Jerry Boldra	SBC Global	X			
22200	Dan Boley	DJA Inspection Services	X			
134782	Steve Caruthers	Tank Consultants, Inc.	X			
154212	Gary Cavey	Conservatek Industries, Inc.	X			
7127	Earl Crochet	Kinder Morgan	X			
150217	Jody Day	Lide Industries, Inc.				X
142685	Domingo de Para	ExxonMobil	X			
133403	Jeffrey DeArmond	BP p.l.c. Whiting Refinery	X			
146748	Terry Delong	Terasen Pipelines (USA) Inc.	X			
135965	Kenneth Erdmann	Matrix Service Company	X			
105011	David Flight	Dow Chemical Company	X			
134870	Laurence Foster	Marathon Ashland Petroleum LLC	X			
134880	John Fumbanks	Pond and Company Inc.				X
115033	Alan Geis	Colonial Pipeline Company	X			
83689	Ty Hagen	Hagen Engineering International, Inc.	X			
136619	Robert Hendrix	Eastman Chemical Co	X			
70596	Marty Herlevic	James Machine Works, Inc.	X			
93133	Randy Kissell	TGB Partnership	X			
81918	Manfred Lengsfeld		X			
135014	John Lieb	Tank Industry Consultants, Inc.	X			

API Ballot Summary Sheet

10/21/2005

Ballot: 40-05: 653-207, Cutting Shell-to-Bottom Weld

AMS ID: 729

Start Date: 8/26/05

Closing Date: 10/7/05

Associate: Gordon Robertson

Coordinator: Gordon Robertson

Proposal:

136274	Thomas Lorentz	AEC Engineering, Inc.	No				X
135072	Francis Maitland	Quense LLC	No				X
113545	James McBride	Petrex, Inc.	No	X			
139045	Craig Meier	ConocoPhillips	No				X
137255	Carl Mikkola	Enbridge Energy Partners, L.P.	No	X			
131185	Douglas Miller	Chicago Bridge & Iron Company(CB&I)	Yes	X			
69609	Bhana Mistry	TIW Steel Platework	No	X			
83736	John Mooney		Yes		X		
92212	George Morovich	TEMCOR	No			X	
136286	Philip Myers	Chevron Corporation	Yes	X			
132210	David Nasab	Kellogg Brown & Root	No	X			
82544	John Oleyar	HMT, Inc.	Yes	X			
5193	Richard Pinegar	Cargill Inc.	No				X
102412	Roy Ralph	Petro-Canada	No				X
135169	Michael Richardson	International Paper	No	X			
73744	Bruce Roberts		No	X			
101360	Marilyn Shores	Sunoco Logistics	No	X			
126019	Larry Speaks	Mass Technology Corporation	No	X			
134314	Tearle Taylor	Flint Hills Resources	No	X			
134325	Donald Thain	Shell Global Solutions (US) Inc.	No	X			
145034	Leith Watkins	Explorer Pipeline Company	No	X			
145896	Alan Watson	A.R. Watson, USA	No	X			
132209	Richard Whipple	Fluor, Inc.	No	X			

API Ballot Summary Sheet

10/21/2005

Ballot: 40-05: 653-207, Cutting Shell-to-Bottom Weld

AMS ID: 729

Start Date: 8/26/05

Closing Date: 10/7/05

Associate: Gordon Robertson

Coordinator: Gordon Robertson

Proposal:

	<u>Affirmative</u>	<u>Negative</u>	<u>Abstain</u>	<u>Did Not Vote</u>
Balloting Totals:	40	2	1	7

Total Responses:	43	
Total Ballots:	50	
Response Rate :	80%	Must be > 50%
Approval Rate:	95%	Must be > 67%
Consensus:	YES	

API Ballot Summary Sheet

10/21/2005

Ballot: 40-05: 653-207, Cutting Shell-to-Bottom Weld

AMS ID: 729

Start Date: 8/26/05

Closing Date: 10/7/05

Associate: Gordon Robertson

Coordinator: Gordon Robertson

Proposal:

API Template for Ballot Comments and Resolution

Ballot ID: 729	Date: November 3, 2005	Document: 40-05-653-207
----------------	------------------------	--------------------------------

#	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	Voter/ Commenter	Company	Section No. (e.g. 3.1)	Type of comment	Comment (justification for change)	Proposed Change	Comment Resolution
1	Philip Myers	Chevron Corporation		Technical	In the last sentence, revise sentence to read, "The shell to bottom weld BOTH INSIDE AND OUTSIDE, shall be removed and replaced ...		
2	John Oleyar	HMT, Inc.		Technical	This is standard practice for most tank companies already. It is a good idea to require it for all.		
3	John Mooney		9.10.1.2.4	Technical	I don't see how this wording results in a stagger.		
4	Nelson Acosta	HMT Inspection	9.10.1.2.4	Technical	While I do not disagree with the proposed additional wording in 9.10.1.2.4, it should be highlighted (or a cautionary statement made) that removal and replacement of this amount of shell-to-bottom weld can result in the need to hydrostatic test the tank per 12.3. If this is not the intent with the added wording here, then I believe additional clarification is required because there will be inevitable questions about this addition and whether or not it results in the need for hydrotesting after repair using this approach.	9.10.1.2.4The shell-to-bottom weld shall be removed and replaced for a minimum distance of 12 inches on each side of the new bottom plate (note: additional requirements per the criteria set forth in 12.3 may need to be met regarding such repairs).	
5	David Flight	Dow Chemical Company	Proposed Change – Append to Section 9.10.1.2.4	Editorial	Add metric measurement (dual dimension) to proposed change.	The shell-to-bottom weld shall be removed and replaced for a minimum distance of 300 mm (12 in.) on each side of the new bottom plate.	

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 6 are compulsory.

API *electronic balloting commenting template/version 2002-12*

API Template for Ballot Comments and Resolution

Ballot ID: 729	Date: November 3, 2005	Document: 40-05-653-207
----------------	------------------------	--------------------------------

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
#	Voter/ Commenter	Company	Section No. (e.g. 3.1)	Type of comment	Comment (justification for change)	Proposed Change	Comment Resolution
6	Douglas Miller	Chicago Bridge & Iron Company(CB&I)	Rationale	Technical	I agree that cutting the corner weld back 12" from the new bottom plate is good practice. But I think the main reason in favor of 12" is as follows. When sliding the new bottom plate under the tank shell, the shell has to be lifted off the plate high enough to allow the welder to make the lap (or butt weld) under the shell. I think the 12" is a practical minimum in order to allow the welder to make the lap weld under the shell without crimping the existing bottom plate. Purely from a weld spacing standpoint 3" offset would be enough.		

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 6 are compulsory.

API *electronic balloting commenting template/version 2002-12*