

API Ballot Comments Sheet

3/17/2008

Ballot: 653-150 Out of Plane Settlement (revised) Ballot

Start Date: 2/1/08

Closing Date: 3/14/08

AMS Ballot ID: 1,336

Associate: Gordon Robertson

Coordinator: Gordon Robertson

Proposal:

22200 Dan Boley

DJA Inspection Services, Inc.

Specification Section

Type

Comment

Suggested Change

Technical

The change in calculating the maximum allowable out of plane settlement is needed and this change will help to eliminate the leveling of small tanks and or finite analysis however the required calculations for this procedure is above the ability of most inspectors and should be part of a fitness for service calculations. I would prefer the present formula be used by the inspector and the proposed formula used in fitness for service.

146748 Terry Delong

Kinder Morgan Canada

Specification Section

Type

Comment

Suggested Change

B.3.2.4

Editorial

This section seems to read that you can avoid repairs simply by performing a more rigorous evaluation, even though that further evaluation may conclude repairs are required.

Delete "in lieu" in first sentence, add "to confirm the necessity for repairs".

API Ballot Comments Sheet

3/17/2008

134870 Laurence Foster

Marathon Petroleum Company LLC

<u>Specification Section</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Comment</u>	<u>Suggested Change</u>
B.3.2.2	Technical	The "final report" should be issued as an API Publication so it is available to the public. Also, it states illustrative examples in a separate document.	

136619 Robert Hendrix

<u>Specification Section</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Comment</u>	<u>Suggested Change</u>
General	Other	I agree.	

115077 Larry Hiner

Chicago Bridge & Iron Company(CB&I)

<u>Specification Section</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Comment</u>	<u>Suggested Change</u>
5.12.1.2	Technical	Base reading shall be from data prior to the first hydrostatic test. When not available assume the tank is initially level.	
B.3.2.2	Technical	Why are certain sizes of tanks not applicable? They are certainly built in these sizes. Add information or provide for direction when these sizes are encountered.	

API Ballot Comments Sheet

3/17/2008

93133 Randy Kissell

TGB Partnership

<u>Specification Section</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Comment</u>	<u>Suggested Change</u>
B.2.1	Editorial	The wording is vague and repititious.	<p>Change:</p> <p>"Measurements for out-of-plane of tank settlement must be taken carefully. These measurements should be performed by personnel experienced in the types of measurement procedures being preformed, and using equipment designed for the intended purpose. Tank settlement measurements should be taken with instruments capable of sufficient accuracy to be able to distinguish settlement differences."</p> <p>to:</p> <p>"Measurements of out-of-plane of tank settlement should be performed by personnel experienced in the types of measurements being performed, using equipment capable of sufficient accuracy to distinguish settlement differences."</p> <p>State what part of the tank Y is the yield strength of.</p>
B.3.2 .1	Technical	Y is defined as the yield strength, but it's not clear what part of the tank it refers to.	
B.3.2.2	Technical	Same comment as for B.3.2.1	

135014 John Lieb

Tank Industry Consultants, Inc.

<u>Specification Section</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Comment</u>	<u>Suggested Change</u>
B.2.2.4	Editorial	See suggested change below.	Suggest changing "goodness of fit" to "method of curve fitting".
B.3.2	Editorial	See suggested change below.	Suggest changing "They are also not applicable to fold patterns..." to "They also do not consider fold patterns..."

API Ballot Comments Sheet

3/17/2008

134120 David Martinez

Hovensa, LLC

Specification Section

Type

Comment

Suggested Change

Technical

I agree with the new methodology to include those issues that were not previously differentiated.

69609 Bhana Mistry

TIW Steel Platework

Specification Section

Type

Comment

Suggested Change

Technical

Abstain from voting as I do not have knowledge on subject item.

131316 David Wang

Shell Oil Company

Specification Section

Type

Comment

Suggested Change

B.2.2.5.1

Technical

The various measurement terms and procedures for determining estimates of the settlement arc length and the corresponding out-of-plane settlement should be defined and clearly explained in the text, not just referred to in a graph. The symbols used in Figure B-4a should be defined, not just graphically but also with text.

The various measurement terms and procedures for determining estimates of the settlement arc length and the corresponding out-of-plane settlement should be defined and clearly explained in the text, not just referred to in a graph. The symbols used in Figure B-4a should be defined, not just graphically but also with text.

API Ballot Comments Sheet

3/17/2008
